

# U.S. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION

Office of Federal Operations P.O. Box 77960 Washington, DC 20013

> Raphael C,<sup>1</sup> Complainant,

> > v.

Nancy A. Berryhill, Acting Commissioner, Social Security Administration, Agency.

Appeal No. 2019000389

Agency No. NY-18-0741

## **DECISION**

Complainant filed a timely appeal with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC or Commission) from the Agency's decision dated September 21, 2018, dismissing his complaint of unlawful employment discrimination in violation of Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 (Title VII), as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 2000e et seq.

## **BACKGROUND**

At the time of events giving rise to this complaint, Complainant worked as a Claims Specialist at the Agency's New Utrecht, New York District Office, until he was reassigned to the Jamaica, New York District Office.

On August 1, 2018, Complainant filed a formal complaint alleging that the Agency subjected him to discrimination on the bases of race/national origin (Hispanic, Puerto Rican), sex (male), religion (Catholic), and reprisal when: (1) on June 6, 2018, he received notice that an investigation would not be initiated into his harassment allegations; and (2) when he was subjected to harassment/inappropriate behavior based on his sex from February 25 through April 4, 2018.

The Agency dismissed the complaint for failure to state a claim and for untimely EEO Counselor contact. The instant appeal followed.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This case has been randomly assigned a pseudonym which will replace Complainant's name when the decision is published to non-parties and the Commission's website.

## **ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS**

#### Claim 1

The regulation set forth at 29 C.F.R. § 1614.107(a)(1) provides, in relevant part, that an agency shall dismiss a complaint that fails to state a claim. An agency shall accept a complaint from any aggrieved employee or applicant for employment who believes that he or she has been discriminated against by that agency because of race, color, religion, sex, national origin, age or disabling condition. 29 C.F.R. §§ 1614.103, .106(a). The Commission's federal sector case precedent has long defined an "aggrieved employee" as one who suffers a present harm or loss with respect to a term, condition, or privilege of employment for which there is a remedy. Diaz v. Dep't of the Air Force, EEOC Request No. 05931049 (Apr. 21, 1994).

The Commission has held that an employee cannot use the EEO complaint process to lodge a collateral attack on another proceeding. See Wills v. Department of Defense, EEOC Request No. 05970596 (July 30, 1998); Kleinman v. United States Postal Service, EEOC Request No. 05940585 (September 22, 1994); Lingad v. United States Postal Service, EEOC Request No. 05930106 (June 25, 1993). In his complaint, Complainant alleged discrimination when the Agency's Harassment Prevention Officer ("HPO") informed him that it would not further investigate his claims. Complainant must raise any claims related to that investigation within that process.

## Claim 2

EEOC Regulation 29 C.F.R. § 1614.105(a)(1) requires that complaints of discrimination should be brought to the attention of the Equal Employment Opportunity Counselor within forty-five (45) days of the date of the matter alleged to be discriminatory or, in the case of a personnel action, within forty-five (45) days of the effective date of the action.

The record discloses that the last alleged harassment event occurred on April 4, 2018, but Complainant did not initiate contact with an EEO Counselor until June 8, 2018, which is beyond the forty-five (45) day limitation period. On appeal, Complainant has presented no persuasive arguments or evidence warranting an extension of the time limit for initiating EEO Counselor contact. Complainant utilized the Harassment Prevention process, within the Agency's Office of Labor Management and Employee Relations, during the relevant time period. However, the Agency's written anti-harassment policy makes it clear that an aggrieved employee must contact an EEO counselor within the 45-day limitation period, and contact with the Agency's HPO would not be considered sufficient contact to preserve the right to file an EEO complaint. The Commission has consistently held that the utilization of agency procedures, union grievances, and other remedial processes does not toll the time limit for contacting an EEO Counselor. See Ellis v. United States Postal Service, EEOC Appeal No. 01992093 (November 29, 2000).

Accordingly, the Agency's final decision dismissing Complainant's complaint is AFFIRMED.

# <u>STATEMENT OF RIGHTS - ON APPEAL</u> <u>RECONSIDERATION</u> (M0617)

The Commission may, in its discretion, reconsider the decision in this case if the Complainant or the Agency submits a written request containing arguments or evidence which tend to establish that:

- 1. The appellate decision involved a clearly erroneous interpretation of material fact or law; or
- 2. The appellate decision will have a substantial impact on the policies, practices, or operations of the Agency.

Requests to reconsider, with supporting statement or brief, must be filed with the Office of Federal Operations (OFO) within thirty (30) calendar days of receipt of this decision. A party shall have twenty (20) calendar days of receipt of another party's timely request for reconsideration in which to submit a brief or statement in opposition. See 29 C.F.R. § 1614.405; Equal Employment Opportunity Management Directive for 29 C.F.R. Part 1614 (EEO MD-110), at Chap. 9 § VII.B (Aug. 5, 2015). All requests and arguments must be submitted to the Director, Office of Federal Operations, Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. Complainant's request may be submitted via regular mail to P.O. Box 77960, Washington, DC 20013, or by certified mail to 131 M Street, NE, Washington, DC 20507. In the absence of a legible postmark, the request to reconsider shall be deemed timely filed if it is received by mail within five days of the expiration of the applicable filing period. See 29 C.F.R. § 1614.604. The agency's request must be submitted in digital format via the EEOC's Federal Sector EEO Portal (FedSEP). See 29 C.F.R. § 1614.403(g). The request or opposition must also include proof of service on the other party.

Failure to file within the time period will result in dismissal of your request for reconsideration as untimely, unless extenuating circumstances prevented the timely filing of the request. Any supporting documentation must be submitted with your request for reconsideration. The Commission will consider requests for reconsideration filed after the deadline only in very limited circumstances. See 29 C.F.R. § 1614.604(c).

## COMPLAINANT'S RIGHT TO FILE A CIVIL ACTION (S0610)

You have the right to file a civil action in an appropriate United States District Court within ninety (90) calendar days from the date that you receive this decision. If you file a civil action, you must name as the defendant in the complaint the person who is the official Agency head or department head, identifying that person by his or her full name and official title. Failure to do so may result in the dismissal of your case in court. "Agency" or "department" means the national organization, and not the local office, facility or department in which you work. If you file a request to reconsider and also file a civil action, filing a civil action will terminate the administrative processing of your complaint.

## RIGHT TO REQUEST COUNSEL (Z0815)

If you want to file a civil action but cannot pay the fees, costs, or security to do so, you may request permission from the court to proceed with the civil action without paying these fees or costs. Similarly, if you cannot afford an attorney to represent you in the civil action, you may request the court to appoint an attorney for you. You must submit the requests for waiver of court costs or appointment of an attorney directly to the court, not the Commission. The court has the sole discretion to grant or deny these types of requests. Such requests do not alter the time limits for filing a civil action (please read the paragraph titled Complainant's Right to File a Civil Action for the specific time limits).

FOR THE COMMISSION:

Carlton M. Hadden, Director Office of Federal Operations

February 8, 2019 Date